

Employers' Feedback on the Performance of Bachelor of Elementary Education (BEED) Graduates in the Workplace: A Pre-Deployment Training Remediation Implications

Fahad Abdul Salendab*1, Rysa Lee Ann Ocariza-Salendab2, Richard D. Sanchez3 ^{1, 2} Sultan Kudarat State University-Kalamansig Campus, Poblacion, Kalamansig, Sultan Kudarat, Philippines ³ ETCOR Educational Research Center, Philippines Corresponding Author e-mail: fahadabdul163@gmail.com

Received: 29 June 2023 Revised: 26 August 2023 Accepted: 30 August 2023

Available Online: 18 September 2023

Volume II (2023), Issue 3, P-ISSN – 2984-7567; E-ISSN - 2945-3577

Abstract

Aim: This study aimed to determine the employers' feedback and satisfaction on the performance of BEED graduates of Sultan Kudarat State University (SKSU) – Kalamansig campus from 2018-2022.

Methodology: The study utilized a survey questionnaire. The survey questionnaire was developed after reviewing relevant research and other journal papers. The study's respondents are the school heads from the Department of Education, school managers from private learning institutions, and a campus director of a state university. A total of 56 employer respondents participated in the study. Descriptive statistics such as frequency and percentages count, mean, and weighted mean were used.

Results: Results revealed that most Bachelor of Elementary Education (BEED) graduates are female, young, and single. Research also revealed that the employers' feedback on the performance of the BEED graduates in the workplace in terms of subject knowledge, assessment, and evaluation was very satisfactory, and this performance meets and often exceeds the employers' satisfaction. At the same time, the employers rated the management learning satisfactorily. The flexibility, dependability, communication, and leadership skills were also evident in the very satisfactory performance of the BEED graduates. Similarly, commitment and collaboration were very satisfactory. Employers have expressed satisfaction with the performance of BEED graduates who meet their job requirements, or the expectations set in terms of subject knowledge, learning management, assessment, evaluation, flexibility and adaptability, dependability, communication and leadership skills, commitment, and collaboration.

Conclusion: Effective communication and leadership skills exhibited by BEED graduates have facilitated strong teacher-student and teacher-parent relationships, contributing to positive learning outcomes. Their willingness to collaborate with colleagues and stakeholders highlights their commitment to teamwork and professional growth. Overall, employers have expressed satisfaction with the performance of BEED graduates who meet their job requirements or the expectations set in terms of subject knowledge, management of learning, assessment and evaluation, flexibility and adaptability, dependability, communication and leadership skills, commitment, and collaboration. The positive feedback indicates the quality of education provided by BEED programs and the dedication of these graduates to contribute effectively to the field of elementary education.

Keywords: Employability, Graduates, Elementary Education, Employers' Feedback, Performance, Workplace

INTRODUCTION

Education plays a vital role in shaping the future of individuals and societies, with teachers serving as the cornerstone of the education system. Program offered by higher education institutions, particularly the BEED program,



equips future educators with the necessary knowledge and skills to become effective and competent teachers at the elementary level.

However, while the BEED curriculum aims to prepare graduates for the complexities of the teaching profession, it is essential to examine the alignment between the program outcomes and the expectations of employers in the workplace. Understanding employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates provides valuable insights into the strengths and areas that require remediation in the program's pre-deployment training.

Moreover, higher education institutions (HEIs) are essential in preparing a nation for global competition by producing competent human capital (Conchada & Tiongco, 2015), as cited by Salendab (2021). Every country spends largely and substantially on these institutions to develop and educate its people, ensuring the nation's future, hence preparing our graduates for their career perspective.

Furthermore, these institutions have the economic responsibility to produce graduates with the necessary knowledge, skills, character, and a modern mindset, which can be a significant factor in their employment. Employers significantly regarded these graduates' attributes for they are valuable assets to the nation's sustainable development and human capital.

Employers were essential partners of higher education institutions (HEIs) in developing graduates' knowledge, skills, and attitudes. This partnership ensures that graduates possess the skills and knowledge necessary for success in the workplace. Employers can provide valuable feedback on the performance of BEED graduates, enabling higher education institutions to modify their curricula and pre-deployment training programs. Thus, their feedback measures the compatibility of skills and traits with organizational requirements, which highly indicates the HEI's academic culture and curriculum effectiveness. Graduates play a crucial role in constructing the image and reputation of the college or university, as they are regarded as the products of all HEIs that reflect the graduate attributes. (Dotong et al., 2017).

On the other hand, HEIs need some help regarding the quality of student preparation for the requirements and trends of the field. There is a concern regarding the preparedness and qualifications of recent graduates to enter the workforce, which is similar to the problem of mismatched jobs.

Andrea (2018) states that the need for more adequate and practical preparation among recent graduates is a growing concern. These concerns included employer complaints about lacking fundamental skills and required competencies, especially for entry-level positions. In other words, the industry relies heavily on academics to produce qualified graduates, but the imbalance persists.

As cited by Mehrotra and Elias (2017), Employers are dissatisfied with most recent graduates' absence of fundamental skills required for success in the workplace and future careers. Therefore, universities and educational authorities must collaborate to implement strategies that address knowledge and skill gaps and align university outputs with employer demands. This implies that school leaders in state universities and colleges should collaborate closely with employers to ensure that graduates possess the necessary skills and character to meet the requirements of their chosen careers. Therefore, it is necessary to investigate the factors employers expect graduates to possess to increase their employability.

Accordingly, it is vital to monitor the graduates and assess the employers as industry partners to assess the program's effectiveness. The graduate and their performance are the most reliable indications of pertinent skills and knowledge because HEIs train graduates for employment. As a result, the employer assessment functions as a feedback mechanism and input for the BEED program of the SKSU-Kalamansig campus in order to develop the industry partners' required skills and knowledge. In light of this premise, the researchers deem this study relevant and research-worthy.

Review of Related Literature

Graduates Employability and Their Performance

An approachable and easy plan for improving employability in higher education was presented by Cheng et al. in 2021. Even though employability and employment are separate concepts, the graduate employment rate is routinely used to gauge how well universities serve their students. This paradigm stresses the comprehension of graduate employability by defining it and identifying its four primary stakeholders—higher education institutions, students, the government, and employers—from their respective points of view. The employability development model also highlights how graduates, higher education institutions, employers, and employment all play a part in creating



jobs, emphasizing that graduate employment should only be considered a sign of a graduate's employability. According to Wellman (2010), the integrated competency model of employability explains how some factors interact to enhance employability. Combining technical and vocational knowledge with general support for micro-level competencies and macro-level attitude and behavior appears to be a revolutionary approach to employability.

The RAW employability framework addresses numerous concerns by presenting a distinct perspective on employability. According to Study and Kottke (n.d.), the RAW model of employability consists of the following components: rewarding, aptitude, and willingness. The RAW framework contributed to the literature by minimizing previous employability research concepts while maintaining employability's essential characteristics (Study & Kottke, n.d.). Due to this identity-based approach to employability, it is suggested that undergraduate courses be altered.

According to Zeijen et al. (2018), skills and educational attainment are crucial determinants of employability. Students, particularly recent graduates, must be better prepared for employability and global citizenship.

Zeijen et al. (2018) claim that job engagement encourages workers to use self-management tools to define goals and keep tabs on their feelings and behavior at work. Employees should create goals that align with organizational priorities to boost job engagement and motivation inside an organization. Employees should monitor their actions to ensure performance improvement and happy involvement at work.

According to Breevaart et al. (2014), managers' external control is optional to boost employee engagement. Employees are urged to specify their goals and objectives and express their actions and feelings. Because of this, they look for resources and challenges, which promotes employee engagement (Zeijen et al., 2018). Assessment will help to highlight future talents, highlight gaps, identify areas that require training and development, and provide them the chance to improve or enhance performance. This data will support effective follow-up, monitoring, and decisionmaking, serve as a foundation for adjusting and evaluating effectiveness and efficiency, support career development, retention, and motivation, and, when closely supervised by their supervisors, create a more welcoming, encouraging work environment aimed at maximizing their potential and contribution to the organization.

Employee engagement significantly impacts an organization's overall performance and goals (Singh, 2018). (Gerards et al., 2018) Agencies must create a high-quality work environment and provide resources to increase employee engagement. Employees with these characteristics are significantly more likely to improve organizational performance in terms of productivity, quality, and deliverance of high levels of customer service, thereby enhancing economic outcomes.

Higher education institutions (HEIs) are required to turn forth graduates capable of meeting the demands of both employers in the contemporary economy and the needs of national development. The features and talent need of the industry's workforce are established, and graduates from higher education institutions may or may not meet these needs.

Employers' Feedback

Employer feedback gives educational institutions trustworthy information about the readiness and performance of their graduates. Many studies have also highlighted the many elements of employability and employer satisfaction. This article discusses employer preferences, models of employability, the school-industry-government push for employability, and employer satisfaction as feedback to schools.

The value that employers place on graduates' knowledge, abilities, and attitudes makes them one of the most significant stakeholders in higher education institutions. Education institutions view employer feedback on graduates' overall success in the workforce as vital admission criteria. The company's feedback will reflect the employee's performance and could significantly influence the graduates' suitability for employment.

According to Mehrotra and Elias (2017), improving graduates' employability is a key area for higher education to concentrate on to ensure their success in the job market. This will fundamentally change how organizations assess their workforce's productivity and general effectiveness. An important admission requirement for educational institutions is employer feedback on graduates' achievement on the standard. The total performance of graduates may occasionally fall below expectations in any case. Critical talents, problem-solving abilities, and the capability to apply domain knowledge and ideas in the workplace are significant areas requiring emphasis (Dotong et al., 2017).





Objectives of the Study

This study aimed to determine the employers' feedback and satisfaction on the performance of BEED graduates of Sultan Kudarat State University (SKSU) - Kalamansig campus from 2018-2022; specifically, this study sought to answer the following objectives:

- 1. To determine the socio-demographic profile of the BEED graduates relative to age, gender, and civil status;
- 2. To determine the level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace; and
 - 3. To determine the employers' satisfaction with the overall performance of BEED graduates in the workplace.

METHODOLOGY

Research Design

This study utilized the quantitative research design employing the descriptive survey method to examine the current situation, which concerns what rather than how or why (Nassaji, 2015). This method was deemed appropriate because it determines the socio-demographic profile of the BEED graduates, the level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates, and the employers' satisfaction towards the BEED graduates of SKSU-Kalamansig Campus from 2018-2022.

Respondents

The study's respondents were the forty (40) school heads from the Department of Education, ten (15) school managers from private learning institutions, and one (1) campus director as employers of the fifty-eight (58) BEEDemployed graduates of batch 2018-2022. Convenience sampling was taken into account. It is a non-probability sampling technique for choosing participants based on accessibility and availability. This accessibility is typically measured regarding geographic proximity but may incorporate other accessibility factors such as contacts. Fifty-six (56) replied to the survey and participated in the study.

Research Instrument

The study utilized a survey questionnaire. The survey questionnaire was developed after reviewing relevant research and other journal papers. This instrument was reviewed and validated by the pool of experts. A kappa alpha of 0.85, evaluated as "excellent," indicates that the self-created questionnaire was valid. Correlation coefficients that did not reach the required standards were either removed or enhanced, while items that exceeded the required standards were maintained. After the instrument's items were finalized, a reliability test was conducted. This test yielded a Cronbach's alpha of 0.72, suggesting the questionnaire was highly reliable.

The instrument contained three parts. The first part contained the socio-demographic profile of the BEED graduates, while the second part contained the level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace.

Statistical Treatment of Data

The data were analyzed using the SPSS software version 21. Descriptive statistics such as frequency and percentages count, mean, and weighted mean were used. The BEED graduates' job performance was interpreted using the 5-point Likert's scale as: Outstanding (4.50 – 5.00); Very Satisfactory (3.50 – 4.49); Satisfactory (2.50 – 3.49); Fair (1.50 - 2.49); Poor (1.00 - 1.49).

RESULTS and DISCUSSION

Table 1. The Socio-Demographic Profile of the BEED Graduates.

	Socio-Demographic Profile	Frequency	Percentage
Age		-	
_	21 – 25	44	75.86
	26 – 30	12	20.69
	31 – 35	2	3.45
Gender			
	Male	9	15.52
	Female	49	84.48
			282

https://etcor.org https://www.facebook.com/EmbracingTheCultureOfResearch https://twitter.com/ETCOR_research https://tinyurl.com/YouTubeETCOR embracingthecultureofresearch@etcor.org 0939-202-9035



Civil Status

Single	42	72.41
Married	13	22.41
Separated/Divorced	1	1.72
Born a child but not married	2	3.45

Table 1 shows the BEED graduates' socio-demographic profile of fifty-eight (58) respondents according to their age, gender, civil status, and residence.

In terms of age, forty-four (44) graduates, or 75.86 percent, are in the range of 21 to 25 years old, while twelve (12), or 20.69 percent, are in the range of 26 to 30 years old, and two (2) or 3.45 percent graduates are in the range of 31 to 35 years old correspondingly. This data shows that most of the respondents are mainly comprised of young ones, which is similar to the study of Ulanday (2021), whose respondents are mainly 20 to 25 years old. This result implies that BEED graduates are developing careers in the teaching profession (Almejas et al., 2017).

Regarding gender, nine (9), or 15.52 percent, are males, while forty-nine (49), or 84.48 percent, are females. These figures suggest that females dominate the teaching profession in primary education. This finding supports Ulanday's (2021) idea that females dominate teaching.

In terms of civil status, forty-two (42), or 72.41 percent, are single, while thirteen (13), or 22.41 percent, are married. One (1), or 1.72 percent, is separated/divorced, while two (2), or 3.45 percent, belong to born a child but not married. The data show that most of the respondents remained single after graduation. This could be attributed to the fact that the graduates are still young to marry (Ulandaya, 2021).

Table 2. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Subject Knowledge

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Subject Knowledge		
1. Demonstrates a solid understanding of the key concepts, facts, and skills taught at the elementary level	3.57	Very Satisfactory
2. Discusses the topic without relying exclusively on the required reading.	4.00	Very Satisfactory
3. Integrates subject matter with students' practical contexts and learning objectives/goals.	4.16	Very Satisfactory
4. Shows expertise in using educational technology in the classroom.	3.77	Very Satisfactory
5. Explain the relevance of current topics to prior lessons and relate the topic to pertinent current issues or daily activities.	3.43	Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.78	Very Satisfactory

The level of employers' feedback on the job performance of BEED graduates in the workplace in terms of subject knowledge is presented in Table 2. As presented in the table, item 3- Integrating subject matter with students' practical contexts and learning objectives/goals was rated with the highest mean of 4.16, which was "very satisfactory" by the employers. The next item that received the highest mean of 4.00, interpreted as "very satisfactory," is item 2. This item states that the graduates discuss the topic without relying exclusively on the required reading. This finding suggests that the BEED graduates perform, meet, and often exceed employers' job requirements.

The next item that received the highest mean was number 4-Shows expertise in using educational technology in the classroom, with a mean score of 3.77, interpreted as "very satisfactory." Evens et al. (2015) stated that teachers must adapt to the latest tools to become proficient in using educational technology.

Another item of the subject knowledge was assessed as "very satisfactory," which received the next highest mean, demonstrating a solid understanding of the key concepts, facts, and skills taught at the elementary level. (item 1). This finding suggests that BEED graduates meet and often exceed the job requirements given by employers.

Moreover, item 5 explains the relevance of current topics to prior lessons and relates the topic to pertinent current issues or daily activities, which the employers assessed as "satisfactory" (3.43). By highlighting how the subject matter connects to relevant and timely issues, students can develop a greater appreciation for its practical applications.



Generally, the employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates concerning subject knowledge was assessed as "very satisfactory" (3.78). The finding suggests that the performance of BEED graduates meets the employers' satisfaction and often exceeds the job requirements. This further suggests that the BEED graduates know the subjects they teach and use various educational tools and strategies to improve students' performance. Quillo (2021) affirmed that teachers must be knowledgeable about the subject and have an efficient method of delivering and interpreting students' thoughts in order for students to grasp the subject content.

Table 3. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Management of Learning

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Management of Learning		
1. Facilitates opportunities for students to engage in class activities through intensive or extensive participation actively.	3.75	Very Satisfactory
2. Undertakes several responsibilities within the educational context, including that of a teacher, resource person, coach, adviser, and referee.	3.09	Satisfactory
3. Develop and execute educational environments and opportunities that facilitate constructive dialogue or interactions.	3.16	Satisfactory
4. Structures/restructure the learning and teaching-learning context to facilitate the achievement of collective learning goals	3.71	Very Satisfactory
5. Encourages students' curiosity and desire to learn more about the topic.	3.77	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.49	Satisfactory

The level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace relative to the management of learning is presented in Table 3. As shown in this table, item 5- Encourages students' curiosity and desire to learn more about the topic. The mean score was 3.77, which is "very satisfactory" by the employers. This finding implies they can spark interest in their students by employing creative teaching methods, incorporating handson activities, and fostering a supportive learning atmosphere.

The table further presents that item 1- received the second highest mean of 3.75, interpreted as "very satisfactory." Item 1- Facilitates opportunities for students to engage in class activities through intensive or extensive participation actively. This finding suggests that intensive or extensive participation creates an inclusive learning environment that encourages all students to contribute and participate in the learning process.

The third highest mean was item 4. The mean score was 3.71, interpreted as "very satisfactory" by the employers. Further, the item states that graduate's structure/restructure the learning and teaching-learning context to facilitate the achievement of collective learning goals. This means these graduates deeply understand educational principles, allowing them to tailor their teaching approach to meet their student's diverse needs and abilities.

The findings based on Table 3 showed that the next to receive the highest means was item 3. It states that the BEED graduates develop and execute educational environments and opportunities that facilitate constructive dialogue or interactions. This item was rated "satisfactory" (3.16). The result suggests that these graduates recognize the importance of creating a positive and inclusive atmosphere where students feel safe to express their ideas, engage in meaningful discussions, and learn collaboratively.

Added to the rating of "satisfactory" was item 2- Undertakes several responsibilities within the educational context, including that of a teacher, resource person, coach, adviser, and referee (3.09). This result suggests that they seamlessly transition between roles, serving as teachers to impart knowledge, resource persons to provide guidance and support, coaches to nurture and develop students' skills, advisers to offer guidance and mentoring, and referees to ensure fair play and resolve conflicts.

The overall mean of 3.49, described as "satisfactory," indicates that the performance of BEED graduates meets and sometimes exceeds the job requirements. These graduates are adept at organizing and overseeing classroom activities, ensuring students are engaged and motivated to learn. This further indicates that the BEED graduates possess the necessary skills and knowledge to meet the job requirements, and they have the potential to go above and beyond what is typically expected. This statement reflects positively on the performance of BEED graduates and indicates that employers are generally satisfied with their work.



Elliot and Lewin (2011), as cited by Aquino (2015) that most employers are satisfied with their graduate recruit. The employers are pleased with the graduates' performance, skills, and abilities in their respective roles. This positive feedback from employers reflects the quality of the graduates and suggests that they are meeting or exceeding the expectations set by the employers.

Table 4. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Assessment and Evaluation

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Assessment and Evaluation		
1. Designs assessment strategies that would achieve the lesson objectives or the learning goals	3.13	Satisfactory
2. Assess the lesson to determine the desired outcome within the allotted time	3.77	Very Satisfactory
3. Employs performance-based assessment and criteria or rubrics to measure students' performance authentically.	4.16	Very Satisfactory
4. Compiles learners' output with a summary of results.	3.57	Very Satisfactory
5. Communicate promptly and clearly to the learners as to the result of the assessment and evaluation	3.75	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.67	Very Satisfactory

As shown in Table 4, all four statements regarding the assessment/evaluation were generally perceived as "very satisfactory" except for 1 statement, which was perceived as "satisfactory" (3.13) by the employers. The overall mean showed that it was 3.67.

This finding implies that the BEED graduate's performance meets and often exceeds the employers' satisfaction relative to assessment and evaluation. This implies that the BEED graduates understand effective assessment methods and successfully evaluate student progress and performance. As a result, employers are satisfied with the graduates' ability to accurately and comprehensively assess and evaluate students' performance. Aquino (2015) said that the majority of employers find assessment and evaluation to be highly valuable. More than half of the employers recognize the importance of assessing and evaluating teachers and students to make informed decisions about their skill levels and progress.

Specifically, all four items under assessment and evaluation were rated "very satisfactory" by the respondents. For instance, item 3- Employs performance-based assessment and criteria or rubrics to measure students' performance authentically obtained the highest mean of 4.16.

From this result, BEED graduates emphasize assessing students' abilities, skills, and knowledge through practical and hands-on tasks or projects rather than solely relying on traditional exams.

Besides, BEED graduates assessed lessons to determine the desired outcomes within the allotted time, item 2 and received the second-highest mean of 3.77. This means that the BEED graduates consistently meet and often surpass the expectations of the employers in terms of assessment and evaluation. Their ability to assess the lesson objectives and ensure timely completion of tasks is highly satisfying to employers.

On the issue reflected in item 5- Communicates promptly and clearly to the learners as to the result of assessment and evaluation, it obtained the mean rating of 3.75. This indicates that the graduates of the BEED program are efficient in providing timely and clear information to learners regarding assessment and evaluation results. These graduates' ability to communicate the evaluation results in this way meets and often surpasses the employers' expectations.

Item 4- Compiles learners' output with a summary of results obtained with a mean rating of 3.57. This compilation of learners' output is said to meet the expectations of employers and even go beyond them in terms of satisfaction. In other words, the graduates' ability to assess and summarize students' performance is highly regarded by employers.

Finally, item 1- Designs assessment strategies that would achieve the lesson objectives or the learning goals obtained a mean score of 3.13, indicating that the BEED graduates can create assessment strategies that align with the lesson objectives or goals. These designed assessment strategies meet and sometimes surpass the expectations of the job requirement.



Table 5. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Flexibility and Adaptability

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Flexibility and Adaptability		
Demonstrates exceptional flexibility by easily adjusting to changing priorities and deadlines	3.43	Satisfactory
2. Displays high adaptability by quickly learning and mastering new technologies, tools, and processes.	3.71	Very Satisfactory
3. Exhibits flexibility in collaborating with diverse teams, effectively adjusting communication and work styles to accommodate different perspectives and personalities.	3.23	Satisfactory
4. Thrives in ambiguous situations, displaying adaptability by embracing uncertainty and finding innovative solutions to complex problems.	3.39	Satisfactory
5. Shows flexibility in balancing multiple projects simultaneously, efficiently reallocating resources, and adapting strategies to meet evolving needs.	3.32	Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.41	Satisfactory

Table 5 shows that the BEED graduates demonstrate flexibility and adaptability, which indicates the ability to adjust and respond effectively to changing circumstances and demands within the field of education.

Based on these results, item 2- Displays a high level of adaptability by quickly learning and mastering new technologies, tools, and processes was rated with the highest mean of 3.71, which was "very satisfactory" by the employers. This finding suggests that these graduates can swiftly learn and become proficient in various technologies, tools, and processes. Moreover, their adaptability surpasses the expectations typically required for their job roles. In essence, this statement highlights the ability of BEED graduates to effectively adapt to and excel in new and evolving work environments.

The next item that receives the highest mean of 3.43, interpreted as "satisfactory," is item 1. This item states that the graduates demonstrate exceptional flexibility by easily adjusting to changing priorities and deadlines. This finding suggests that the graduates can quickly and smoothly adapt to changes in priorities and deadlines. Their ability to do so often surpasses the expectations and requirements of their job.

The next item that received the highest mean was number 4- Thrives in ambiguous situations, displaying adaptability by embracing uncertainty and finding innovative solutions to complex problems with a mean score of 3.39, interpreted as "satisfactory." This indicates that the graduates excel in situations that lack clear direction or are uncertain. They demonstrate adaptability by embracing these ambiguous situations and can find creative and innovative solutions to complex problems. Their performance in such circumstances often meets, and sometimes even exceeds, the requirements in the workplace.

The succeeding item is item 5- Which shows flexibility in balancing multiple projects simultaneously, efficiently reallocating resources, and adapting strategies to meet evolving needs with a mean score of 3.32, interpreted as "satisfactory." This suggests that the BEED graduates can effectively manage multiple projects at once. They demonstrate flexibility by efficiently reallocating resources and adapting strategies to address changing needs. Their performance in this area meets and sometimes exceeds the expectations of job requirements.

Moreover, item 3- Exhibits flexibility in collaborating with diverse teams, effectively adjusting communication and work styles to accommodate different perspectives and personalities obtained a mean score of 3.23, interpreted as "satisfactory." This suggests that BEED graduates possess flexibility when working in teams with diverse individuals. They can adjust their communication and work styles to accommodate different perspectives and personalities within the team. This further suggests that the graduates' performance in this regard not only meets the job requirements but also has the potential to exceed them. This implies that their ability to collaborate effectively and adapt to varying situations and personalities is highly valuable and beneficial in a professional setting.

Generally, the flexibility and adaptability of the BEED graduates were perceived as "satisfactory" (3.41) by the employers. The performance of BEED graduates relative to flexibility and adaptability is satisfactory, often meeting and occasionally exceeding the employer's satisfaction. These graduates possess a diverse skill set that enables them to navigate various challenges in the educational field. Employers often find BEED graduates to be quick learners who



readily embrace new methodologies, pedagogies, and educational reforms. Their willingness to continuously upgrade their skills and knowledge through professional development opportunities further enhances their performance and adaptability in the field. The performance of BEED graduates in flexibility and adaptability proves promising, satisfying the expectations of employers and highlighting their ability to excel in the dynamic field of education.

According to Avey et al. (2014), an employee's adaptability and character produce a positive work environment, as demonstrated by a pleasant personality. It is what employers seek in prospective employees.

According to Mortimer and Doll (2017), the top four skills are character, teamwork, adaptability, and responsibility, and organizations must invest in cultivating these skills. Adaptability is essential because it reduces the perception of abusive supervision among employees. Due to the rapidly altering demands of the workplace, employees must be adaptable to assist the organization in moving forward and keeping up with recent developments.

Table 6. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Dependability

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Dependability		
Ensures that tasks and responsibilities are completed consistently and on time.	3.46	Satisfactory
2. Follows through on commitment and delivering high-quality work, even when faced with challenges or obstacles.	3.46	Satisfactory
3. Inspires trust and confidence among colleagues, superiors, and students.	3.75	Very Satisfactory
4. Proactively works, takes initiative, and anticipates needs or potential issues to ensure smooth academic operations.	3.71	Very Satisfactory
5. Understand the importance of punctuality and reliability, consistently showing up on time and fulfilling their obligations.	3.70	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.61	Very Satisfactory

Table 6 shows the level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace relative to dependability. Based on these results, the overall mean of the 5-item statements was 3.61, which is described as "very satisfactory." This finding implies that the graduates display a strong sense of responsibility and reliability, ensuring they meet their commitments and perform their duties effectively. Their dedication to their work and their students is evident, and they consistently go above and beyond to ensure that they meet and often exceed the satisfaction of their employers.

This statement is supported by Aquino (2018), who said that most of the employed teacher education graduates show that they are dependable in completing their responsibilities promptly. They are reliable and can be trusted to fulfill their duties and obligations within the expected time frame. Employers can count on these graduates to complete their responsibilities promptly and efficiently.

The specific per-item results indicated that three items (3,4 and 5) were rated "very satisfactory." Item 3 (3.75) indicates that BEED graduates inspire trust and confidence among their colleagues, superiors, and students. It further indicates that these graduates consistently perform at a level that meets or often surpasses their job expectations. In other words, BEED graduates are seen as reliable, competent, and capable educators who are highly effective in their profession.

Item 4- Proactively works, takes the initiative, anticipates needs or potential issues to ensure smooth academic operations, and receives a mean score of 3.71, which inferred that they are proactive problem-solvers who take preemptive action to ensure academic operations run smoothly.

Item 5- Understands the importance of punctuality and reliability, consistently showing up on time and fulfilling their obligations, obtained the mean score of 3.70. This finding suggests that the graduates consistently arrive on time and fulfill their obligations, showcasing their dedication and commitment. These graduates not only meet but often exceed employers' satisfaction.

The results also indicated that two items (1 and 2) were rated "satisfactory" and had the same mean of 3.46. Item 1- Ensures that tasks and responsibilities are completed consistently and on time means that BEED graduates diligently complete tasks and responsibilities consistently and within the expected timeframe. They prioritize timely



completion of their work, meeting the job requirements consistently. It also indicates that, at times, their performance may go beyond the job requirements, indicating their commitment and efficiency.

Item 2- Follows through on commitment and delivering high-quality work, even when faced with challenges or obstacles, indicates that graduates from the BEED program display a strong sense of dedication and are capable of producing work of high quality. They can uphold their commitment and handle challenges or obstacles effectively. Their performance sometimes meets the expectations of their job requirements.

Table 7. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Communication Skills

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Communication Skills		
1. Develop strong verbal communication skills to effectively engage students in discussion and posters in a participatory learning environment	3.86	Very Satisfactory
2. Uses a positive learning atmosphere rather than negative teacher-student interaction	3.59	Very Satisfactory
3. Conveys information clearly and concisely to their students.	4.18	Very Satisfactory
4. Practices empathy to connect with students emotionally and create a supportive learning environment.	3.73	Very Satisfactory
5. Practices active listening to understand the student's needs and concerns.	3.89	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.85	Very Satisfactory

Table 7 reflects the communication skills as one of the job performance indicators of the BEED graduates in the workplace.

As reflected in this table, communication skills have 5 item statements. Item 3- Conveys information clearly and concisely to their students and obtained a mean score of 3.86, described as "very satisfactory." This shows that the BEED graduates can convey information clearly and concisely to their students. This means they can effectively communicate ideas and concepts in a way easily understood by the students. It is mentioned that this performance meets and often exceeds the job requirement, indicating that clear and concise communication is a highly valued skill in education.

Item 5- Practices active listening to understand the students' needs and concerns received a mean score of 3.89, described as "very satisfactory." Based on this result, it stated that their performance in this aspect often exceeds the job requirements. It means that BEED graduates are skilled at actively listening to their students and paying close attention to their needs and concerns. This ability goes beyond what is expected in their job, indicating that they excel in this area. Elliot and Lewis (2015) affirmed that employers expect graduates to demonstrate various skills and attributes, including communication skills.

Item 1- Develops strong verbal communication skills to effectively engage students in discussion and posters a participatory learning environment, received the highest mean of 4.18, described as "very satisfactory." This means that the graduates of the BEED program possess excellent verbal communication skills. These skills allow them to effectively engage students in discussions and create a participatory learning environment. It states that graduates' performance in these areas often exceeds the expectations set by the job requirements.

Item 4- Practices empathy to connect with students on an emotional level and creates a supportive learning environment has the mean score of 3.73, described as "very satisfactory," indicating that the BEED graduates are trained to practice empathy to establish an emotional connection with their students. This empathy helps create a supportive and nurturing learning environment. The statement implies that this level of performance in practicing empathy often goes beyond what is expected or required for the job.

Item 2- Uses a positive learning atmosphere rather than negative teacher-student interaction has a mean score of 3.59, described as "very satisfactory." This result suggests that graduates with BEED degrees prefer creating a positive learning environment rather than relying on negative interactions between teachers and students. By fostering a positive atmosphere, these graduates can meet and often surpass the expectations of their job requirements. They believe in the power of positive interactions and create an environment that enhances learning and achievement.



The overall mean score of 3.85, described as "very satisfactory," implies that the performance of BEED graduates, as assessed by their employers in terms of communication skills, is consistently impressive. These graduates not only meet but also often exceed the satisfaction of employers. Their strong communication skills enable them to effectively interact with students, colleagues, and parents, fostering positive relationships and creating a conducive learning environment. Employers appreciate their articulate and confident communications as they cultivate effective collaboration and teamwork. The finding supports the idea of Lowden et al. (2011), as cited by Aquino (2018), who said employers are satisfied with their graduates because they demonstrate a wide range of skills and attributes, including teamwork and communication skills.

Table 8. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Leadership Skills

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Leadership Skills		
1. Establishes a supportive and valuable classroom environment where students feel supported.	3.55	Very Satisfactory
2. Manages and organizes effectively classroom activities, ensuring that instructional time is maximized and students are engaged in meaningful learning experiences.	3.68	Very Satisfactory
3. Demonstrates strong communication skills, effectively conveying information and ideas to students, colleagues, and parents.	3.45	Satisfactory
4. Possess strong decision-making skills, making informed choices that benefit student learning.	3.38	Satisfactory
5. Influences others to take professional development and other teaching endeavors to improve student outcomes	3.79	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.57	Very Satisfactory

As seen in Table 8, leadership skills have items that describe the job performance of graduates in the BEED program.

Item 5- Influences others to take professional development and other teaching endeavors to improve student outcomes received the highest mean score of 3.41, described as "very satisfactory." The finding proposes that graduates from the BEED program positively influence others when participating in professional development and other teaching activities to enhance student outcomes. It implies that these graduates go beyond the basic expectations of their jobs and consistently meet or exceed the requirements set for them.

The next item that received the highest mean of 3.68, which had a description of "very satisfactory," was item 2. It stated that graduates manage and organize classroom activities effectively, ensuring that instructional time is maximized, and students are engaged in meaningful learning experiences. This means that graduates significantly encourage others to engage in activities such as professional development and other teaching initiatives to enhance student outcomes. These graduates not only meet the job requirement regarding their performance but often surpass it by inspiring and influencing others to actively participate in improving teaching practices and students' achievements.

Further, the result indicates that item 1- Establishes a supportive and valuable classroom environment in which students feel supported received the mean score of 3.55, described as "very satisfactory." This implies that these graduates excel in creating a classroom environment that is both supportive and valuable for students. This further implies that these graduates go above and beyond the job requirements by ensuring that students feel supported emotionally, academically, and socially. This dedication to cultivating a positive learning environment contributes to the success and well-being of the students.

On the other hand, the mean of item 3 was 3.45, described as "very satisfactory," which means that the BEED graduates demonstrate strong communication skills, effectively conveying information and ideas to students, colleagues, and parents.

Correspondingly, item 4 states that the graduates possess strong decision-making skills, making informed choices that benefit student learning, which means they can make informed choices that benefit student learning. These individuals can analyze different options and make sound judgments that contribute to improving student learning outcomes and educational experiences.



Generally, the overall mean of 3.57 was described as "very satisfactory. The finding implies that the performance of BEED graduates in terms of leadership skills consistently meets and often exceeds employers' satisfaction and job requirements. Employers often express satisfaction with the dedication and professionalism demonstrated by these graduates. Their ability to multitask and maintain a positive work environment further contributes to their success in leadership roles.

As Elliot and Lewis (2011), cited by Aquino (2018), employers are satisfied with their graduates because they demonstrate a wide range of skills and attributes, including communication and leadership skills. These graduates have been equipped to effectively lead and manage diverse groups of students, colleagues, and stakeholders in educational settings. Their ability to communicate effectively sets them apart as exceptional leaders.

Table 9. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Commitment

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Commitment		
1. Practices effective attendance and punctuality, shows up on time and is present for classes and meetings	3.75	Very Satisfactory
Demonstrates unwavering dedication to the education and well-being of the students.	3.32	Satisfactory
3. Invests time and resources to enhance their teaching methods and keep abreast of the most recent educational practices.	4.11	Very Satisfactory
4. Fosters a positive and inclusive classroom environment where students feel valued, supported, and motivated to learn.	3.79	Very Satisfactory
5. Understands each student's unique needs and challenges and provide personalized attention and guidance to help them reach their full potential.	4.05	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.80	Very Satisfactory

Table 9 reflects the level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace in terms of commitment. As reflected, five items assessed the performance of BEED graduates in commitment.

Item 3- Invests time and resources to perpetually enhance their teaching methods and keep abreast of the most recent educational practices was rated by the employers with a mean score of 4.11, interpreted as "very satisfactory." This means that graduates in the BEED program devote significant time and resources to continually improve their teaching approaches and stay updated on the latest educational practices. As a result, their performance often not only meets but also surpasses the expectations of their employers or job requirements.

Item 5- Understands each student's unique needs and challenges and provides personalized attention and quidance to help them reach their full potential was rated by the employers with a mean of 4.05, interpreted as "very satisfactory." This result implies that BEED graduates deeply understand the individual needs and challenges of each student they encounter. They go beyond the basic job requirements and provide personalized attention and guidance to help students reach their full potential. This further implies that the BEED graduates prioritize the development and success of their students, ensuring that their job performance goes above and beyond what is typically expected in their role as educators.

Item 4- Fosters a positive and inclusive classroom environment where every student feels valued, supported, and motivated to learn, obtained a mean rating of 3.79, described as "very satisfactory." This denotes that the graduates create a positive and inclusive classroom environment where every student feels valued, supported, and motivated to learn. They go beyond the basic job requirement by actively fostering a sense of belonging and ensuring that each student's needs are met. This meets the job requirements and often exceeds them, contributing to a more inclusive and engaging learning environment for their students.

The subsequent item is item 1- Practices effective attendance and punctuality, shows up on time, and is present for classes and meetings. This item states that the graduates practice effective attendance and punctuality, shows up on time, and are present for classes and meeting. This was rated with a mean score of 3.75, described as "very satisfactory." This result suggests that graduates in the BEED program demonstrate effective attendance and punctuality skills. They consistently arrive on time and are present for their classes and meetings. Their performance



in this area, as rated by their employers, meets or even exceeds the job requirement. This implies that BEED graduates are reliable and responsible when meeting their professional obligations.

Finally, item 2- Demonstrates unwavering dedication to the education and well-being of the students received a mean rating of 3.32, described as "satisfactory." The result suggests that BEED graduates show a deep and unwavering commitment to the education and well-being of their students. They prioritize their students' needs and consistently strive to provide them with the best education and support. This commitment to their students' success sometimes meets the job requirements and occasionally exceeds expectations.

The overall mean of 3.80, described as "very satisfactory," indicates that their steadfast commitment to their profession consistently marks the performance of BEED graduates. Their dedication to providing quality education to young learners often surpasses the exceptions and satisfaction of their employers.

According to De Castro et al. (2016), these graduates are distinguished by their willingness to go above and beyond to show their sincerity and dedication to their careers and the organizations where they belong.

Table 10. Level of Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace Relative to Collaboration

Items	Mean	Descriptive Rating
Collaboration		
1. Participates in collaborative planning and decision-making to collectively identify and address the diverse needs of the students.	4.00	Very Satisfactory
2. Cooperates with others to help overcome problems and challenges in the school.	3.86	Very Satisfactory
3. Creates a sense of family in the workplace by assisting those who are having difficulty completing their assignments	4.07	Very Satisfactory
4. Demonstrates the organization's significant values in attaining its vision and mission.	3.68	Very Satisfactory
5. Promotes a positive image of the organization through serving the students effectively.	3.89	Very Satisfactory
Overall Mean	3.90	Very Satisfactory

Table 10 presents the level of employers' feedback on the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace relative to collaboration. As presented, item 3- Creates a sense of family in the workplace by assisting those who are having difficulty completing their assignments, received the highest mean score of 4.07, described as "very satisfactory." This suggests that graduates with BEED programs can foster a supportive and close-knit work environment. They do this by offering assistance to colleagues who are struggling to finish their tasks. It implies that this behavior goes above and beyond what is expected in their job, as they not only meet the job requirements but often exceed them by creating a sense of family and providing helpful support to their colleagues.

Moreover, item 1- Participates in collaborative planning and decision-making to collectively identify and address the diverse needs of the students received the second highest mean score of 4.00, described as "very satisfactory." The result signifies that the graduates actively collaborate when planning and making decisions. They work with their colleagues to recognize and cater to the diverse needs of students. This level of collaboration fulfills the job requirement and goes beyond it, demonstrating their commitment to ensuring students' overall well-being and success.

The sustainability of the organization's positive image was also evident among the BEED graduates. Item 5 states that these graduates promote a positive image of the organization by serving the students effectively. This was manifested by the mean score of 3.89, described as "very satisfactory."

Another item that received the highest mean of 3.86 is item 2- Cooperates with others to help overcome problems and challenges in the school, which is described as "very satisfactory." This implies that the BEED graduates work collaboratively with others to address and resolve issues and difficulties within the school setting. Their level of performance in this regard not only meets the expectations of their job requirements but often surpasses them. In other words, they actively engage in teamwork and problem-solving efforts to improve the overall functioning and environment of the school.



Finally, item 4- Demonstrates the organization's significant values in attaining its vision and mission also received a higher mean score of 3.68, described as "very satisfactory." This denotes that the graduates effectively showcase the values of the organization in order to achieve its vision and mission. They not only meet the job requirements but often surpass them. These graduates align well with the organization's values, goals, and direction, contributing to its success.

The overall mean score of 3.90, described as "very satisfactory," signifies that the performance of BEED graduates in the workplace in terms of collaboration consistently meets and often exceeds employers' satisfaction. With a strong educational background and a focus on fostering teamwork and cooperation, BEED graduates are wellequipped to excel in collaborative settings. Employers consistently praise the collaborative skills of the BEED graduates when working in team environments. They can seamlessly collaborate with colleagues from diverse backgrounds and readily adjust to evolving educational practices.

The performance of BEED graduates in collaboration goes above and beyond employers' expectations. Their commitment to teamwork and shared sense of purpose make them a valuable asset in any collaborative setting.

This similar result was also highlighted in the study by De Castro et al. (2016), emphasizing the importance of graduates' collaborative skills to employers. As a result, graduates are recruited with high expectations regarding their concern for the environment and clients' well-being as part of the organization's image-building process and their ability to demonstrate genuine enthusiasm in any workplace.

Table 11. Employers' Satisfaction with the Overall Performance of BEED Graduates in the Workplace.

BEED Overall Performance	Frequency	Percentage
Very Much Satisfied	5	8.92
Much Satisfied	36	64.28
Moderately Satisfied	12	21.41
Less Satisfied	3	5.35
Not Satisfied	0	0
TOTAL	56	100

Table 11 reflects the employers' satisfaction with the overall performance of BEED graduates. As reflected in this table, thirty-six (36), or 64.28 percent of the employers, are very satisfied with the performance of the graduates of the BEED program. Twelve (12) or 21.41 percent of the respondents are moderately satisfied with the performance of the BEED graduates. The other five (5) or 8.92 percent of employers are very satisfied with the BEED graduates' performance. The remaining three (3) or 5.35 percent of employer respondents are less satisfied with the performance of the BEED graduates in the workplace.

Elliot and Lewin (2011), as cited by Aquino (2015), reported that most employers are satisfied with their graduate recruit. These graduates possess a strong foundation in pedagogy, instructional techniques, and classroom management skills, which make them well-prepared to excel in the field of education.

Conclusion

In light of the findings of this study, the researchers concluded that most Bachelor of Elementary Education (BEED) graduates are female, young, and single. The findings of this study also showed that the level of employers' feedback on the performance of graduates showed very satisfactory performance in the workplace, and their performance meets and often exceeds the job requirements or the employers' satisfaction. These graduates have consistently demonstrated a strong foundation of subject knowledge, essential for effectively teaching elementary-level subjects. Their ability to effectively manage learning processes and create engaging and inclusive learning environments has been praised by employers. They have also shown proficiency in assessing and evaluating student progress, ensuring appropriate interventions and support are provided.

Moreover, BEED graduates have displayed remarkable flexibility and adaptability in their teaching approaches, enabling them to cater to diverse student needs and adapt to changing educational requirements. Their dependability and commitment to their profession have been commendable, following through on responsibilities and demonstrating a genuine passion for teaching.



Effective communication and leadership skills exhibited by BEED graduates have facilitated strong teacherstudent and teacher-parent relationships, contributing to positive learning outcomes. Their willingness to collaborate with colleagues and stakeholders highlights their commitment to teamwork and professional growth.

Overall, employers have expressed satisfaction with the performance of BEED graduates who meet their job requirements or the expectations set in terms of subject knowledge, management of learning, assessment and evaluation, flexibility and adaptability, dependability, communication and leadership skills, commitment, and collaboration. The positive feedback indicates the quality of education provided by BEED programs and the dedication of these graduates to contribute effectively to the field of elementary education.

Recommendation

The study recommends the employers' feedback as the pre-deployment training remediation and program development baseline. It is also recommended that educational institutions provide comprehensive and up-to-date training programs that enhance key competencies and skills. This may include teaching methodologies, technology integration, and opportunities for practical experience to develop their abilities further. With the current study limitations, further research must be conducted to identify the progress of the BEED program curriculum.

REFERENCES

- Almejas, B. C., Marasigan, J. C., Morante, T. A., Lim, E. J. A., & Catuday, R. A. (2017). Teacher Education graduates: A tracer study. International Conference on Law, Business, Education, and Corporate Social Responsibility, Cebu, Philippines.
- Andreas, S. (2018). Effects of the decline in social capital on college graduates' soft skills. Industry and Higher Education, 0950422217749277.
- Aquino, A.B. et.al (2015). Employers' Feedback on the Performance of Teacher Education Graduates. Asia Pacific Journal of Multidisciplinary Research, 3(4)
- Avey, J. B., Wernsing, T. S., & Luthans, F. (2014). Can positive employees help positive Organizational change? Impact of psychological capital and emotions on relevant attitudes and behaviors. The Journal of Applied Behavioral Science, 44(1), 48-70.
- Breevaart, K., Bakker, A. B., & Demerouti, E. (2014, February). Daily self-management and employee Work engagement. Journal of Vocational Behavior, 84(1), 31±38. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jvb.2013.11.002
- Cheng, M., Adekola, O., Albia, J., & Cai, S. (2021). Employability in higher education: A review of key Stakeholders' perspectives. Higher Education Evaluation and Development, 16(1), 16±31. https://doi.org/10.1108/heed-03-2021-0025
- De Castro, E. L., Prenda, M. T. B., Dolot, J. A., Laguador, J. M., & Dotong, C. I. (2016). Employers' Feedback on the Job Performance of Computer Engineering Graduates in an Asian Academic Institution. Asia Pacific Journal of Education, Arts and Sciences, 3(3).
- Dotong, C. I., et.al (2017). Employers' Feedback on Job Performance of Engineering Graduates in One Private Academic Institution in the Philippines. Asia Pacific Journal of Education, Arts and Sciences, 4(1).
- Frey, C. B., & Osborne, M. A. (2017). The future of employment: How susceptible are jobs to Computerization? Technological Forecasting and Social Change, pp. 114, 254–280.
- Gerards, R., de Grip, A., & Baudewijns, C. (2018). Do new ways of working increase work Engagement? Personnel Review, 47(2), 517±534. https://doi.org/10.1108/pr-02-2017-0050

896



- Lowden, K., Hall, S., Elliot, D. &Lewin, J. (2011). Employers' Perceptions of the Employability Skills of New Graduates Research commissioned by the Edge Foundation. URL: http://goo.ql/BW9bU9
- Mehrota, A. & Elias, H. (2017). Employer's Feedback on Business Graduates. Journal of WEI Business and Economics. 6(1), 1-9.
- Salendab, F. A., & Dapitan, Y. C. (2021). Performance of Private Higher Education Institutions and the School Heads' Supervision in South Central Mindanao. Psychology and Education, 58(3), 3980-3997.
- Singh, S. (2018). The impact of employee engagement on organizational performance case of an insurance brokerage company in Gauteng. IOSR Journal of Business and Management, 20(6), 66-76. https://doi.org/10.9790/487X-2006076676
- Ulanday, M. (2021). Tracer Study and Employability Skills Acquisition of Teacher Education Graduates. Psychology and Education. 58(4), 1678–1683.
- Wellman, N. (2010). The employability attributes required of new marketing graduates. Marketing Intelligence & Planning, 28(7), 908±930. https://doi.org/10.1108/02634501011086490
- Zeijen, M. E., Peeters, M. C., & Hakanen, J. J. (2018). Workaholism versus Work Engagement and Job Crafting: What is the role of self-management strategies? Human Resource Management Journal, 28(2), 357±373. https://doi.org/10.1111/1748-8583.12187